**Table 1b. Risk of bias assessment of studies addressing weight maintenance among adults from the general population**

|  |  | **QUESTION\*** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **Reporting** | | | | | | | | | | **External validity** | | | **Internal Validity-bias** | | | | | | | **Internal Validity-confounding and selection bias** | | | | | | **Power** |
| **Author, year** | **N analyzed** | **1** | **2** | **3** | **4** | **5** | **6** | **7** | **8** | **9** | **10** | **11** | **12** | **13** | **14** | **15** | **16** | **17** | **18** | **19** | **20** | **21** | **22** | **23** | **24** | **25** | **26** | **27** |
| **BMI/diet** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Bes-Rastrollo2 | 9182 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Berry, 20103 | 500 | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Howard, 20061 | 48835 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| **BMI/physical activity** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Berry, 20103 | 500 | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Lamb, 200215 | 260 | Y | Y | N | Y | P | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| Muscari, 201016 | 120 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| Petrella, 200317 | 284 | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | Y | N | N | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | Y | Y |
| Schmitz, 200718 | 164 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y |
| **BMI/combination** | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Burke, 20036 | 137 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | Y | U | U | U | N | U | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| French, 20114 | 90 households | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | N |
| Levine, 20075 | 284 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| **BMI/Environment** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Berry, 20103 | 500 | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| **Weight/self-management** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Mozaffarian, 20117 | 120877 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | U | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| **Weight/diet** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Adair, 20118 | 3028 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | U | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Bes-Rastrollo2 | 9182 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Bhargava,200214 | 926 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | Y | N | U | U | U | N | U | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | Y |
| Howard, 20061 | 48835 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| Lewis, 20119 | 3906 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | U | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Mozaffarian, 20117 | 120877 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | U | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Pereira, 200510 | 3031 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | U | U | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Purslow, 200819 | 6764 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Schulz,200520 | 24958 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | U | U | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | N | N |
| Vioque, 200811 | 206 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | Y | N | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | N | N |
| **Weight/physical activity** | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Adair, 20118 | 3028 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | U | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Lee, 201112 | 34079 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | U | U | N | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| Lewis, 20119 | 3906 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Mozaffarian, 20117 | 120877 | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | U | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| Schmitz, 200718 | 164 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y |
| **Weight/combination** | |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Levine, 20075 | 284 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| Lombard, 201013 | 215 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| **Weight/environment** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Fortmann, 198121 | 2151 | N | Y | N | Y | N | N | N | N | N | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | U | N | Y | U | Y | N | Y | N | N | U | N | N |
| **Waist circ/diet** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bhargava,200214 | 926 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | Y | N | U | U | U | N | U | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | Y |
| Howard, 20061 | 48835 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| **Waist circ/physical activity** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Muscari, 201016 | 120 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| **Waist circ/combination** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Burke, 20036 | 137 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | Y | U | U | U | N | U | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | Y | U | Y | N | Y |
| Lombard, 201013 | 215 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y |
| **Progression to overweight and obesity/diet** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Bes-Rastrollo2 | 9182 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | U | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | N |
| **Progression to overweight and obesity/combination** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Burke, 20036 | 137 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | Y | U | U | U | N | U | Y | N | Y | N | Y | Y | U | Y | U | Y | N | Y |
| Levine, 20075 | 284 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| **Adherence/physical activity** | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Lamb, 200215 | 260 | Y | Y | N | Y | P | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | N | Y |
| Muscari, 201016 | 120 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| Petrella, 200317 | 284 | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | Y | N | N | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | Y | Y |
| Schmitz, 200718 | 164 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y |
| **Adherence/combination** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| French, 20114 | 90 households | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | N | N | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | N |
| Levine, 20075 | 284 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | N | N | U | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y |
| **Mortality/diet** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Howard, 20061 | 48835 | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | U | N | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | Y | Y | Y |
| **Activity-related injury/physical activity** |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Petrella, 200317 | 284 | Y | Y | N | Y | N | N | Y | N | N | Y | Y | U | Y | N | Y | Y | Y | Y | U | Y | Y | Y | Y | N | U | Y | Y |

\*Questions

1. Is the hypothesis/aim/objective of the study clearly described?

2. Are the main outcomes to be measured clearly described in the Introduction or Methods section?

3. Are the characteristics of the patients included in the study clearly described?

4. Are the interventions of interest clearly described?

5. Are the distributions of principal confounders in each group of subjects to be compared clearly described?

6. Are the main findings of the study clearly described?

7. Does the study provide estimates of the random variability in the data for the main outcomes?

8. Have all important adverse events that may be a consequence of the intervention been reported?

9. Have the characteristics of patients lost to follow-up been described?

10. Have actual probability values been reported (e.g. 0.035 rather than <0.05) for the main outcomes except where the probability value is less than 0.001?

11. Were the subjects asked to participate in the study representative of the entire population from which they were recruited?

12. Were those subjects who were prepared to participate representative of the entire population from which they were recruited?

13. Were the staff, places, and facilities where the patients were treated representative of the treatment the majority of patients receive?

14. Was an attempt made to blind study subjects to the intervention they have received? (We did not use the responses to this question to rate the Risk of Bias given the nature of the interventions)

15. Was an attempt made to blind those measuring the weight outcomes of the intervention? (This item must have been answered Yes for a trial to have low Risk of Bias)

16. If any of the results of the study were based on “data dredging”, was this made clear?

17. In trials and cohort studies, do the analyses adjust for different lengths of follow-up of patients, or in case-control studies, is the time period between the intervention and outcome the same for cases and controls?

18. Were the statistical tests used to assess the main outcomes appropriate?

19. Was compliance with the intervention/s reliable?

20. Were the main outcome measures used accurate (valid and reliable)?

21. Were the patients in different intervention groups (trials and cohort studies) or were the cases and controls (case-control studies) recruited from the same population?

22. Were study subjects in different intervention groups (trials and cohort studies) or were the cases and controls (case-control studies) recruited over the same period of time?

23. Were study subjects randomized to intervention groups?

24. Was the randomized intervention assignment concealed from both patients and health care staff until recruitment was complete and irrevocable?

25. Was there adequate adjustment for confounding in the analyses from which the main findings were drawn?

26. Were losses of patients to follow-up taken into account?

27. Did they report a power calculation?

N=no,P=partially, U=unable to determine, Y=yes

**References**

1. Howard BV, Manson JE, Stefanick ML et al. Low-fat dietary pattern and weight change over 7 years: the Women's Health Initiative Dietary Modification Trial. JAMA 2006; 295(1):39-49.

2. Bes-Rastrollo M, Basterra-Gortari F, Sáínchez-Villegas et al. A prospective study of eating away-from-home meals and weight gain in a Mediterranean population: the SUN (Seguimiento Universidad de Navarra) cohort. Public Health Nutrition 2010; 13(9):1356-63.

3. Berry TR, Spence JC, Blanchard C, et al. Changes in BMI over 6 years: the role of demographic and neighborhood characteristics. Int J Obes (Lond) 2010; 34(8):1275-83.

4. French SA, Gerlach AF, Mitchell NR, et al. Household Obesity Prevention: Take Action-a Group-Randomized Trial. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2011.

5. Levine MD, Klem ML, Kalarchian MA et al. Weight gain prevention among women. Obesity (Silver Spring) 2007; 15(5):1267-77.

6. Burke V, Giangiulio N, Gillam HF, et al. Physical activity and nutrition programs for couples: a randomized controlled trial. J Clin Epidemiol 2003; 56(5):421-32.

7. Mozaffarian D, Hao T, Rimm EB, et al. Changes in diet and lifestyle and long-term weight gain in women and men. N Engl J Med 2011; 364(25):2392-404.

8. Adair LS, Gultiano S, Suchindran C. 20-year trends in Filipino women's weight reflect substantial secular and age effects. J Nutr 2011; 141(4):667-73.

9. Lewis C, Smith D, Wallace D, et al. Seven-year trends in body weight and associations with lifestyle and behavioral characteristics in Black and White young adults: the CARDIA Study. American Journal of Public Health 1997; 87(4):635-42.

10. Pereira MA, Kartashav AI, Ebbeling CB et al. Fast-food habits, weight gain, and insulin resistance (the CARDIA study): 15-year prospective analysis. The Lancet 2005; 365(9453):36-42.

11. Ballor DL, Harvey-Berino JR, Ades PA, et al. Contrasting effects of resistance and aerobic training on body composition and metabolism after diet-induced weight loss. Metabolism 1996; 45(2):179-83.

12. Lee I, Djoussé L, Sesso H, Wang L, Buring J. Physical activity and weight gain prevention. JAMA 2010; 303(12):1173-9.

13. Lombard C, Deeks A, Jolley D, et al. A low intensity, community based lifestyle programme to prevent weight gain in women with young children: cluster randomised controlled trial. Br Med J 2010; 341:c3215.

14. Bhargava A, Guthrie JF. Unhealthy eating habits, physical exercise and macronutrient intakes are predictors of anthropometric indicators in the Women's Health Trial: Feasibility Study in Minority Populations. Br J Nutr 2002; 88(6):719-28.

15. Lamb SE, Bartlett HP, Ashley A, et al. Can lay-led walking programmes increase physical activity in middle aged adults? A randomised controlled trial. J Epidemiol Comm Health 2002; 56(4):246-52.

16. Muscari A, Giannoni C, Pierpaoli L et al. Chronic endurance exercise training prevents aging-related cognitive decline in healthy older adults: A randomized controlled trial. International Journal of Geriatric Psychiatry 2010; 25(10):1055-64.

17. Petrella RJ, Koval JJ, Cunningham DA, et al. Can primary care doctors prescribe exercise to improve fitness? The Step Test Exercise Prescription (STEP) project. Am J Prev Med 2003; 24(4):316-22.

18. Schmitz KH, Hannan PJ, Stovitz SD, et al. Strength training and adiposity in premenopausal women: strong, healthy, and empowered study. Am J Clin Nutr 2007; 86(3):566-72.

19. Purslow LR, Sandhu MS, Forouhi N et al. Energy intake at breakfast and weight change: prospective study of 6,764 middle-aged men and women. Am J Epidemiol 2008; 167(2):188-92.

20. Schulz M, Nothlings U, Hoffmann K, et al. Identification of a food pattern characterized by high-fiber and low-fat food choices associated with low prospective weight change in the EPIC-Potsdam cohort. J Nutr 2005; 135(5):1183-9.

21. Fortmann SP, Williams PT, Hulley SB, et al. Effect of health education on dietary behavior: the Stanford Three Community Study. Am J Clin Nutr 1981; 34(10):2030-8.