Table E.19. Characteristics of studies comparing CBT versus other psychotherapy

| Author, Year | Study Country, Study Design, Type of Study (Efficacy/ Effectiveness), Study Settings | Type of Anxiety/Severity (CGI) | Intervention and Comparisons (N of Patients) | Characteristics of Interventions (Psychotherapy: Components, Delivery Model)/Pharm: Drug) Intensity, Duration (Weeks)) | Patient Characteristics Mean Age (Range) , Male (%), Race/Ethnicity, Comorbidity, Household Income, Parent Education, Family Dysfunction/Stressor, Treatment Sequence, Insurance, History of Maltreatment) | Length of Follow up (Weeks) |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Abbasi, 201627 | Iran  RCT  Efficacy  Outpatient | SAD | Child CBT, (N=15) | Modular CBT  Individual-based  Exposure cognitive problem solving, 4-20 1 hour sessions. | Age range : 6-7 years  Male: 53% | 13 |
| Other therapy, (N=15) | Other: Child parent relationship training.  One session a week for 10 weeks | Age range : 6-7 years  Male: 33.3% |
| Control, (N=16) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age range : 6-7 years  Male: 48% |
| Chavira, 2014 156 | United States RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, SAD, SoP, SP | Child CBT, (N=24) | Cool Kids  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  Individual based  Delivered by primary care physicians  10 sessions over 12 weeks, 60-90mins each | Age mean (years): 9.75 (range: 8-13)  Males: 42%  Caucasian: 83.3%  Hispanic: 8.3%  Other: 12.5%  Less than high school or high school graduate (parent): 16.7%  Some college (parent): 16.7%  College graduate (parent): 33%  OCD: 16.7%  Depression: 12.5%  Disruptive Behavior Disorders: 12.5%  Autism: 4.2% | 12 |
| Distance Therapy, (N=24) | Cool Kids  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  10 sessions over 12 weeks, 60-90mins each | Age mean (years): 9.5 (range: 8-13)  Males: 46%  Caucasian: 62.5%  Hispanic: 12.5%  Other: 20.8%  Less than high school or high school graduate (parent): 12.5%  Some college (parent): 25.0%  College graduate (parent): 45.8%  OCD: 8.3%  Depression: 4.2%  Disruptive Behavior Disorders: 25%  Autism: 4.2% |
| Cobham, 2012 36 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, PD, PD with agoraphobia, SAD, SoP, SP | Child CBT plus separate parent intervention, (N=23) | Do as I do  Individual-based  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  6 90-minutes sessions for parent and 6 60-minutes for child, weekly Delivered by Masters level clinicians | Age mean (years): 9.70 (range: 7-14)  Males: 50%  Caucasian 92%  Asian: 8%  PTSD: 4%  ADHD: 7%  Dysthymia: 4%  Enuresis: 4% | 26 |
| Distance Therapy, (N=20) | Do as I do  "Do as I Do" and "Facing your Fears" bibliotherapy programs  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  2 hour parent group, every other week 12 min phone calls for 12 weeks  Delivered by parent and therapist | Age mean (years): 10.20 (range: 7-14)  Males: 55%  Caucasian 92%  Asian: 8%  ADHD: 5%  PTSD: 5%  Dysthymia: 5%  Sleep terrors: 5% |
| Control, (N=12) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age mean (years): 9.83 (range: 7-14)  Males: 57%  Caucasian 92%  Asian: 8%  PTSD: 4% |
| Dewis, 200137 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | SP | Child CBT, (N=9) | Generic CBT  Live graded exposure  Child CBT- (parents included < 20%)  Individual based  Exposure  Three 45-min treatment sessions every 3–4 days  Provided by clinical psychologists | Male: 35.7%  Caucasian: 100%  Age mean (years): 12.3 (Range 10-17) | 4 |
| Distance Therapy, (N=10) | Other: Computer-aided vicarious exposure  Individual computer based  Exposure  Three 45-min treatment sessions every 3–4 days | Male: 35.7%  Caucasian: 100%  Age mean (years): 13.8 (Range 10-17) |
| Control, (N=9) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Male: 35.7%  Caucasian: 100%  Age mean (years): 13.3 ( Range 10 – 17) |
| Hancock, 2016 44 | Australia  RCT  Effectiveness  Mental health clinic | GAD, SAD | ACT, (N=68) | Acceptance and commitment therapy (ACT)  Group based  Relaxation  10 sessions, 90-minute weekly sessions  Delivered by doctoral level psychologist | Age mean (years): 11.15 ( range: 7-17)  Male: 45.5%  Caucasian: 87%, Asian: 3%, Other: 10%  ADHD: 6%, Depression, 18%, OCD: 7.3%  Treatment naïve: 27.9% | 13 |
| Child and parent together CBT, (N=63) | Cool Kids  Group based  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  10 sessions, 90-minute weekly sessions  Delivered by doctoral level psychologist | Age mean (years): 10.81 ( range: 7-17)  Male: 39.6%  Caucasian: 94.4%, Other: 5.6%  ADHD: 10%, Depression, 13%, OCD: 3%  Treatment naïve: 22.2% |
| Control, (N=62) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age mean (years): 11.66 ( range: 7-17)  Male: 41.9%  Caucasian: 84%, Other: 16%  Depression: 24%, OCD: 8%  Treatment naïve: 70.9 |
| Karbasi, 2010157 | Iran  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | Anxiety disorder | Child CBT plus parent involvement, (N=22) | Being Brave  Exposure, relaxation, Cognitive Problem Solving  Group-based 8, 75min weekly sessions | Age mean (years): 14.2 ( range: 12-17) | 3 |
| Distance therapy, (N=22) | Being Brave  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Individual Based  4, 75min weekly sessions, 4 sessions via CD | Age mean (years): 15.1 ( range: 12-17) |
| Khanna, 2010102 | United States  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, PD, SAD, SoP, SP | Child CBT, (N=17) | Coping Cat  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Individual-based  Delivered by psychologist, student/ trainee  Weekly for 12 weeks, 50 minute sessions | Age mean (years): 10.1 (range: 7-13)  Males: 67%  Caucasian: 83%  African American: 14%  Hispanic: 2%  ADHD: 16%  ODD:4%  Tic disorder: 2% | 13 |
| Distance, (N=16) | Camp cope a lot  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Individual based  Delivered by psychologist, student/ trainee  Weekly for 12 weeks, |
| Control, (N=16) | Attention control or treatment as usual  Individual-based  Technology-based  Delivered by psychologist, student/ trainee  Weekly for 12 weeks, 60 minute sessions. 30 minutes of support and 30 minutes of computer. |
| Leong,2009158 | Australia  Efficacy  RCT | GAD, SAD, SoP,SP | Child CBT plus parent Intervention, (N=15) | Do as I Do  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  Individual based  Weekly for 12 weeks | Total population: 27  Age mean (years): 9.26 (range: 7-14)  Males: 63%  Caucasian: 100%  Less than high school or high school graduate (parent); 40.7%  College graduate (parent): 59.3%  OCD: 4%  Agoraphobia: 4% | 20 |
| Distance therapy, (N=15) | Do as I Do  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  Delivered by parents  Weekly for 12 weeks |
| Mendlowitz, 1999 56 | Canada  RCT  Efficacy  Outpatient |  | Child CBT, (N=23) | Coping Bear  Child CBT- (parents included < 20%)  Group based  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  12 1.5-hour weekly sessions  Delivered by 3 psychologists, 1 student/trainee, 1 youth worker | Age mean (years): 9.5 (Range 7- 12)  Male: 28.4% | NR |
| Parent only intervention, (N=21) | Generic CBT  Group based  12 1.5-hour weekly sessions  Delivered by doctoral level psychologist, and student/trainee |
| Child CBT plus separate parent intervention, (N=18) | Coping Bear  Group based  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  12 1.5-hour weekly sessions (one for kids, one for parents)  Delivered by doctoral level psychologist, student/trainee, youth worker |
| Control, (N=40) | Waitlisting or no treatment |
| Miller, 197258, 59 | United States  RCT  Efficacy  Outpatient | SP | Child CBT, (N=NR) | Reciprocal inhibition  Individual-based  Relaxation  Exposure  Delivered by doctoral psychologist  60 min session 3 times per week for 8 weeks | Age mean (years): 10.8 (range: 6-14)  Male: 55%  Caucasian: 95.5%  African American: 4.5%  Socioeconomic status:  Low income: 7%  Middle income:75%  High income: 8% | 104 |
| Other therapy, (N=NR) | Individual, play psychotherapy directed toward inner experiences  60 min session 3 times per week for 8 weeks |
| Control, (N=NR) | Waitlist: 60 min session 3 times per week for 8 weeks |
| Monga, 2015159 | Canada  RCT  Efficacy  Outpatient | NR | Parent Only intervention, ( N=32) | Taming sneaky fears  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Group based  Delivered by psychologist, Masters level clinician, psychiatrist  60 min parents, 60 min child (attention placebo) Weekly for 11 weeks | Age mean (years): 7 (range: 5-7)  Male: 40.6%  Caucasian: 90.6% | 52 |
| Child CBT + parent intervention, (N=45) | Taming sneaky fears  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Group Based  Delivered by psychologist, Masters level clinician, psychiatrist  60min parents, 60min child(CBT) Weekly, 11 weeks | Age mean (years): 6.6 (range: 5-7)  Male: 35.6%  Caucasian: 88.9% |
| Muris, 1998 153 | Netherland  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | SP | Other therapy  , (N=9) | EMDR  Delivered by psychotherapist  1,150min session | Age mean (years): 12.58 ( range: 8-17)  Caucasian: 100%  Medium income: 100% | 0 |
| Child CBT, (N=9) | Generic CBT  Exposure  Individual  Delivered by behavioral scientist  1,150min session |
| Distance Therapy, (N=8) | Generic CBT  Exposure  Individual-based exposure cognitive strategies  Delivered by behavioral scientist  1,150min session |
| Rapee, 200669 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, PD (agoraphobia is not specified), SAD, SP, SoP. | Child and parent together CBT, (N=90) | Cool Kids  Group based  Exposure  Cognitive problem solving  9 2-hour sessions over 12 weeks Delivered by student trainee. | Age mean (years): 9.475 (Range: 6 -12)  Male: 66.6%  Low income: n= 26 (<$30,000) | 36 |
| Distance Therapy, (N=90) | Other: Bibliotherapy  Individual based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  Treatment duration is 12 weeks at own pace | Age mean (years): 9.558 (Range: 6 – 12)  Male: 64.44%  Low income: n= 9 (<$30,000) |
| Control, (N=87) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age mean (years): 9.5 (Range: 6 – 12)  Male: 48.2%  Low income: n= 15(<$30,000) |
| Spence, 200681 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, SAD, SP SoP | Child CBT plus separate parent intervention, (N=22) | Generic CBT  Group based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  10 60-minute weekly child sessions and 6 60-minute weekly parent sessions, plus booster sessions at 1 and 3 months  Delivered by 5 doctoral level psychologists. | Age mean (years): 10.26 (Range 7-14)  Male: 59% | 12 |
| Distance Therapy, (N=27) | Generic CBT  Internet CBT  Group based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  5 of the 10 child sessions plus the 3-month booster via Internet, with the remaining sessions being conducted in the clinic; 3 of the 6 parents sessions and the 3-month via Internet  Delivered through the internet | Age mean (years): 9.8 (Range 7-14)  Male: 59.2% |
| Control, (N=23) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age mean (years): 9.8 (Range 7-14)  Male: 56.5% |
| Spence, 201182 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Mental health clinic | GAD, SAD, SoP, SP | Distance Therapy, (N=44) | Brave online  Technology-based  Individual based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  10 adolescents weekly sessions and 5 parent sessions (60 minutes each) over 12 weeks; 1 15-minute phone call, email feedback after each session  Delivered by psychologist, Masters level clinician | Age mean (years): 13.98 (range: 12-18)  Males: 41%  High income(>$76,910): 47%  College graduate (parent): 58%  Depression: 2.6%  ODD: 1.7%  Dysthymic disorder: 9.7% | 52 |
| Child CBT plus separate parent intervention, (N=44) | Individual based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  10 adolescents weekly sessions and 5 parent sessions (60 minutes each) over 12 weeks  Delivered by psychologist, Masters level clinician |
| Control, (N=27) | Waitlisting or no treatment |
| Waters, 200986 | Australia  RCT  Efficacy  Outpatient | GAD, SAD, SoP, SP | Child CBT plus separate parent intervention, (N=38) | Take action  Group based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  10 weekly 1-hour child and one hour parents sessions  Delivered by psychologist | Age mean (years): 6.89 (range: 4-8)  Males: 37%  Caucasian: 97% | 52 |
| Parent only intervention, (N=31) | Take action  Group based  Exposure  Relaxation  Cognitive problem solving  10 weekly 1-hour child and one hour parents sessions  Delivered by psychologist | Age mean (years): 6.68 (range: 4-8)  Males: 58%  Caucasian: 97% |
| Control, (N=11) | Waitlisting or no treatment | Age mean (years): 6.79 (range 4-8)  Males: 55%  Caucasian: 91% |
| Waters, 2013160 | Australia  RCT  Outpatient | GAD, SAD, SoP, SP | AMB, (N=18) | Attention bias modification training  Individual based  4 sessions a week for 3 weeks | Age mean (years): 9.3 (range: 7-13)  Males: 28%  Caucasian: 100% | 0 |
| CBT, (N=16) | 4 sessions a week for 3 weeks | Age mean (years): 9.9 (range: 7-13)  Males: 44%  Caucasian: 100% |

ACT: acceptance and commitment therapy, ADHD: attention deficit hyperactivity disorder, BRAVE: body signs, relaxation, active helpful thoughts, victory over your fears, enjoy! reward yourself, CBT: cognitive behavioral therapy, CD: compact disc, CGI: clinical global impression, GAD: generalized anxiety disorder, NR: not reported, OCD: obsessive compulsive disorder, ODD: oppositional defiant disorder, PD: panic disorder, PTSD: posttraumatic stress disorder, RCT: randomized controlled trial, SAD: separation anxiety disorder, SoP: social anxiety, SP: specific phobia