Figure 4a. Summary across measurement domains of comparisons of meditation with nonspecific active controls  
[See combined legend for Figures 4a and 4b following the figures for further information, including explanations of symbols and definitions of lettered footnotes]

|  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Outcome** | **Meditation Program** | **Population** | **Direction1 (Magnitude2) of Effect** | **Number of Trials**  **Total [PO]: PA (MA)3, total N** | **SOE4** |
| Anxiety (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (0% to +44%) | 7 [3]: 6 (6), N=558 | Moderate for ↑ |
|  | Mantra | Various | Ø (−3% to +6%) | 3 [2]: 3 (3), N=237 | Low for Ø |
| Depression (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (0% to +52%) | 9 [4]: 8 (8), N=768 | Moderate for ↑ |
|  | Mantra | Various | ↑↓ (−19% to +46%) | 4 [1]: 4 (2), N=420 | Insufficient |
| Stress/Distress (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (+1% to +21%) | 8 [3]: 6 (6), N=697 \* | Low for ↑ |
|  | Mantra | Select | Ø (−6% to +1%) | 3 [1]: 3 (2), N=219 | Low for Ø |
| Negative Affect (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (0% to +44%) | 13 [5]:11 (11), N=1102+ | Low for ↑ |
|  | Mantra | Various | ↑↓ (−3% to +46%) | 5 [2]: 5 (0), N=438 \*\* | Insufficient |
| Positive Affect (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (+1% to +55%) | 3 [0]: 3 (3), N=255 | Insufficient |
|  | TM (Mantra) | CHF | Ø (+2%) | 1 [0]: 1 (0), N=23 | Insufficient |
| Quality of Life (KQ1) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑ (+5% to +28%) | 4 [2]: 4 (3), N=346 | Low for ↑ |
| Attention (KQ2) | Mindfulness | Caregivers | ↑ (+15% to +81%) | 1 [0]: 1 (0), N=21 | Insufficient |
| Sleep (KQ3) | Mindfulness | Various | ↑↓ (−3% to +24%) | 4 [1]: 3 (3), N=451 | Insufficient |
| Substance Use (KQ3) | TM | CAD | Ø | 1 [2]: 0 (0), N=201 | Insufficient |
| Pain (KQ4) | Mindfulness | Select | ↑ (+5% to +31%) | 4 [2]: 4 (4), N=341 | Moderate for ↑ |
|  | TM (Mantra) | CHF | Ø (−2%) | 1 [2]: 1 (0), N=23 | Low for Ø |
| Weight (KQ4) | TM (Mantra) | Select | Ø (−1% to +2%) | 3 [0]: 2 (0), N=297 | Low for Ø |

Figure 4a shows summary across measurement domains of comparisons of meditation with non-specific active controls.  We show the meta-analytic effect sizes for each outcome which are listed below. Negative numbers favor meditation, and positive numbers favor control.
Anxiety mindfulness: -0.40 (confidence interval  (CI) -0.71, -0.08)
Anxiety mantra: -0.22 (-.49, +.04)
Depression mindfulness: -.32 (-.66, +.01)
Depression mantra: -.24 (-.70, +.21)
Stress/distress mantra: -.26 (-.55, +.04)
Negative affect mindfulness: -.34 (-.53, -.14)
Positive affect mindfulness: -.31 (-.71, +.09)
Quality of life mindfulness: -.28 (-.62, +.06)
Sleep mindfulness: -.12 (-.37, +.14)
Pain mindfulness: -.33 (-.62, -.03)


**Notes:** SOE = Strength of Evidence; PO = Number of trials in which this was a primary outcome for the trial; PA = Primary Analysis;  
MA = Meta-analysis; CSM = Clinically Standardized Meditation, a mantra meditation program; TM=Transcendental Meditation, a mantra meditation program; CHF = Congestive Heart Failure; CA = Cancer; CAD = Coronary Artery Disease  
Meta-analysis figure shows Cohen’s d with the 95% CI  
\*Summary effect size not shown due to concern for publication bias for this outcome  
\*\*We did not perform meta-analysis on this outcome since it would duplicate the anxiety meta-analysis for mantra. Two additional trials could be added (on depression) but did not have usable data that could be added to the anxiety meta-analysis. Anxiety and depression are indirect measures of negative affect, and therefore resulted in a lower strength of evidence than for the outcome of mantra on anxiety.  
+Negative affect combines the outcomes of anxiety, depression, stress/distress, and is thus duplicative of those outcomes