

MASSACHUSETTS INSTITUTE OF TECHNOLOGY

6.436J/15.085J  
Problem Set 2

Fall 2018

**Readings:**

Notes from Lecture 2 and 3.

**Supplementary readings:**

[GS], Sections 1.4-1.7.

[C], Chapter 1.3

[W], Chapter 1.

**Exercise 1.** Consider a probabilistic experiment involving infinitely many coin tosses, and let  $\Omega = \{0, 1\}^\infty$  (think of 0 and 1 corresponding to heads and tails, respectively). A typical element  $\omega \in \Omega$  is of the form  $\omega = (\omega_1, \omega_2, \dots)$ , with  $\omega_i \in \{0, 1\}$ .

As in the notes for Lecture 2, we define  $\mathcal{F}_n$  as the  $\sigma$ -field consisting of all sets whose occurrence or nonoccurrence can be determined by looking at the result of the first  $n$  coin flips. The  $\sigma$ -field  $\mathcal{F}$  for this model is defined as the smallest  $\sigma$ -field that contains all of the  $\mathcal{F}_n$ .

- (a) Consider the event  $H$  consisting of all  $\omega$  with the following property. There exists some time  $t$  at which the number of ones so far is greater than or equal to the number of zeros so far. Show that  $H \in \mathcal{F}$ .
- (b) (Harder) Consider the set  $A$  of all  $\omega$  for which the limit

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \omega_i$$

exists. Show that  $A \in \mathcal{F}$ .

*Note:* This is important because, once we have also chosen a probability measure, it allows us to make statements about the probability that this limit (the long-term fraction of heads) exists.

*Hint:* The event  $A_x$  “the limit defined above exists and is equal to  $x$ ” belongs to  $\mathcal{F}$ . However, this does not imply that  $\bigcup_x A_x \in \mathcal{F}$  (why?). You need to find some other way of describing the event  $A$  in terms of unions, complements, etc., of events in the  $\mathcal{F}_n$ . For example, use the fact that a sequence converges if and only if it is a “Cauchy sequence.”

**Solution:**

- (a) Let  $S_n = \{(\omega_1, \omega_2, \dots) \mid \sum_{i=1}^n \omega_i \geq \lceil n/2 \rceil\}$ , i.e.,  $S_n$  is the set of sequences where there are at least as many ones, in the first  $n$  entries as there are zeroes. Then,

$$H = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} S_n.$$

- (b) Let

$$a_n = \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \omega_i.$$

According to Cauchy criterion, the sequence  $\{a_n\}$  converges if and only if for any positive integer  $r$ , there exists some positive integer  $N$  such that for any  $n > m > N$ ,

$$|a_n - a_m| < 1/r.$$

For a pair of positive integers  $n > m$ , we define

$$A_{1/r,n,m} = \left\{ \omega : \frac{1}{n} \sum_{i=1}^n \omega_i - \frac{1}{m} \sum_{i=1}^m \omega_i < 1/r \right\} \in \mathcal{F}_n.$$

Thus,

$$A = \bigcap_{r=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{N=1}^{\infty} \bigcap_{m=N}^{\infty} \bigcap_{n=m}^{\infty} A_{1/r,n,m} \in \mathcal{F}.$$

**Exercise 2.** Suppose that the events  $A_n$  satisfy  $\mathbb{P}(A_n) \rightarrow 0$  and  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{P}(A_n^c \cap A_{n+1}) < \infty$ . Show that  $\mathbb{P}(A_n \text{ i.o.}) = 0$ . *Note:*  $A_n$  i.o., stands for “ $A_n$  occurs infinitely often”, or “infinitely many of the  $A_n$  occur”, or just  $\limsup_n A_n$ . *Hint:* Borel-Cantelli.

**Solution:** Define the set

$$A = \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = \bigcap_{n=1}^{\infty} \bigcup_{m=n}^{\infty} A_m.$$

We wish to show  $\mathbb{P}(A) = 0$ . Now,  $A \subseteq \bigcup_{m=n}^{\infty} A_m$  for all  $n$ , and by monotonicity of the measure,  $\mathbb{P}(A) \leq \mathbb{P}(\bigcup_{m=n}^{\infty} A_m)$ , for all  $n$ . In addition,

$$\begin{aligned} \bigcup_{m=n}^{\infty} A_m &= A_n \cup (A_{n+1} \setminus A_n) \cup (A_{n+2} \setminus A_{n+1}) \cup \dots \\ &= A_n \cup (A_{n+1} \cap A_n^c) \cup (A_{n+2} \cap A_{n+1}^c) \cup \dots \end{aligned}$$

Therefore, by the union bound,

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{P}(A) &\leq \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcup_{m=n}^{\infty} A_m\right) \\ &\leq \mathbb{P}(A_n) + \sum_{m=n}^{\infty} \mathbb{P}(A_{m+1} \cap A_n^c). \end{aligned}$$

This holds for all  $n$ , and therefore it holds in the limit as  $n$  goes to infinity. But the limit of the final expression is zero, since  $\mathbb{P}(A_n) \rightarrow 0$ , and since  $\sum_{n=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{P}(A_n^c \cap A_{n+1}) < \infty$ .

**Exercise 3.** Consider one of our standard probability spaces  $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ , with  $\Omega = (0, 1]$ ,  $\mathcal{F}$  – Borel and  $\mathbb{P}$  – the Lebesgue measure. To every element  $\omega \in \Omega$  we assign its infinite decimal representation. We disallow decimal representations that end with an infinite string of nines. Under this condition, every number has a unique decimal representation.

- (a) Let  $A$  be the set of points in  $(0, 1]$  whose decimal representation contains at least one digit equal to 9. Find  $\mathbb{P}[A]$ .
- (b) Let  $B$  be the set of points that have infinitely many 9's in the decimal representation. Find  $\mathbb{P}[B]$ . (Hint: Borel-Cantelli).

**Solution:** Part (a).

We will find the Lebesgue measure of  $A^c$ , the set of points in  $(0, 1]$  whose decimal representation contains no digit equal to 9. We can scale that set (by multiplying it with a real number) to obtain the set

$$A_0 = \frac{1}{10}A^c,$$

which is the set of points in  $(0, 1]$  whose decimal representation starts with a 0, and contains no digit equal to 9 afterwards. Since the set  $A_0$  is just the same as  $A^c$  but scaled down by a factor of 10, we have that  $\mathbb{P}(A_0) = \frac{1}{10}\mathbb{P}(A^c)$ . Furthermore, we can do translations of that set to obtain analogous sets starting with different digits. In particular, let us define

$$A_k = \frac{k}{10} + A_0$$

as the set of points in  $(0, 1]$  whose decimal representation starts with a  $k$ , and has no digit equal to 9 afterwards. Note that these sets are all disjoint, and that we have

$$A^c = \bigcup_{k=0}^8 A_k.$$

Then, using the finite additivity property of measures, and the fact that the Lebesgue measure is invariant by translations, we obtain

$$\begin{aligned} \mathbb{P}(A^c) &= \mathbb{P}\left(\bigcup_{k=0}^8 A_k\right) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^8 \mathbb{P}(A_k) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^8 \mathbb{P}(A_0) \\ &= \sum_{k=0}^8 \frac{1}{10} \mathbb{P}(A^c) \\ &= \frac{9}{10} \mathbb{P}(A^c). \end{aligned}$$

This equality can only be true if  $\mathbb{P}(A^c) = 0$ , and thus  $\mathbb{P}(A) = 1$ .

Part (b). Let  $B_i$  be the event that there is a 9 in the  $i$ -th position of the expansion. These events are independent with  $\mathbb{P}(B_i) = 1/10$ , for all  $i \geq 1$ . Thus, we have

$$\sum_{i=1}^{\infty} \mathbb{P}(B_i) = \infty.$$

Then, by Borel-Cantelli, we have

$$\mathbb{P}(B) = \mathbb{P}(\{B_i \text{ i.o.}\}) = 1.$$

**Exercise 4.** Consider a probability space  $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$ , and let  $A$  be an event (element of  $\mathcal{F}$ ). Let  $\mathcal{G}$  be collection of all events that are independent from  $A$ . Show that  $\mathcal{G}$  need not be a  $\sigma$ -algebra.

**Solution:**  $\mathcal{G}$  need not be a  $\sigma$ -algebra. For example, let  $X, Y$  be i.i.d., with  $\mathbb{P}(X = 1) = \mathbb{P}(X = 0) = 1/2$ . Let  $Z$  be the mod two sum of  $X$  and  $Y$ , so that if  $X = Y$ , then  $Z = 0$ , and if  $X \neq Y$ , then  $Z = 1$ . Then pairwise, these three random variables are independent. Let  $A$  be the event  $\{Z = 1\}$ . Now, the

events  $B_1 = \{X = 1\}$ ,  $B_2 = \{Y = 1\}$  are both independent of  $A$ . However,  $B_1 \cap B_2$  is not independent of  $A$ .

**Exercise 5.** Let  $A_1, A_2, \dots$  and  $B$  be events.

- (a) Suppose that  $A_k \searrow A$ , i.e.  $A_k \supset A_{k+1}$  and  $A = \bigcap_{k=1}^{\infty} A_k$ . Assume  $B$  is independent of  $A_k$ . Show that  $B$  is independent of  $A$ .
- (b) Suppose that  $A_1$  is independent of  $B$  and also that  $A_2$  is independent of  $B$ . Is it true that  $A_1 \cap A_2$  is independent of  $B$ ? Prove or give a counterexample.

**Solution:**

- (a) The sequence of events  $A_k \cap B$  is decreasing and converges to the event  $A \cap B$ . [To see this, note that  $(\bigcap_{k \geq 1} A_k) \cap B = \bigcap_{k \geq 1} (A_k \cap B)$ .] Using the continuity of probability measures in the first and last equalities below, and independence in the middle equality, we have

$$\mathbb{P}(A \cap B) = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(A_k \cap B) = \lim_{k \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(A_k) \mathbb{P}(B) = \mathbb{P}(A) \mathbb{P}(B).$$

- (b) Consider two independent and fair coin tosses and let  $A_i$  be the event that the  $i$ th toss results in heads. Let  $B$  be the event that both tosses give the same result. It is easily checked that  $\mathbb{P}(A_i \cap B) = \mathbb{P}(\{HH\}) = 1/4 = \mathbb{P}(A_i) \mathbb{P}(B)$ , so that pairwise independence holds. On the other hand,  $\mathbb{P}(B \mid A_1 \cap A_2) = 1 \neq \mathbb{P}(B)$ . Thus,  $A_1 \cap A_2$  and  $B$  are not independent.

**Exercise 6.** Let  $(\Omega, \mathcal{F}, \mathbb{P})$  be a probability space. Show that function

$$d(A, B) \triangleq \mathbb{P}[A \Delta B]$$

satisfies the triangle inequality (i.e.  $d(A, B) \leq d(A, C) + d(C, B)$  for any  $A, B, C$ ).

*Fun fact:* Under this pseudo-metric any algebra is dense in the  $\sigma$ -algebra it generates. Thus, any event in a complicated  $\sigma$ -algebra (such as Borel) can be approximated arbitrarily well by events in a simple algebra (like finite unions of  $[a, b)$ ).

**Solution:** The symmetric difference is  $A \Delta B = (A \setminus B) \cup (B \setminus A)$

$$\begin{aligned} A \Delta B &= (A \setminus B) \cup (B \setminus A) \\ &= (A \cap B^c) \cup (B \cap A^c) \\ &= (A \cap B^c \cap C) \cup (A \cap B^c \cap C^c) \cup (B \cap A^c \cap C) \cup (B \cap A^c \cap C^c) \\ &\subset (C \setminus B) \cup (A \setminus C) \cup (C \setminus A) \cup (B \setminus C) \\ &= (A \Delta C) \cup (C \Delta B). \end{aligned}$$

Hence, by the union bound,

$$\mathbb{P}(A\Delta B) \leq \mathbb{P}(A\Delta C) + \mathbb{P}(C\Delta B).$$

**Exercise 7. [Optional, not to be graded]** Let  $\Omega_1 \subset \Omega$  and let  $\mathcal{C}$  be some collection of subsets of  $\Omega$ . Let

$$\mathcal{C}_1 = \mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1 \triangleq \{A \cap \Omega_1 : A \in \mathcal{C}\}$$

and denote by  $\mathcal{F}_1$  ( $\mathcal{F}$ ) the minimal  $\sigma$ -algebra on  $\Omega_1$  ( $\Omega$ ) generated by  $\mathcal{C}_1$  ( $\mathcal{C}$ ). Also define

$$\mathcal{F}_2 = \mathcal{F} \cap \Omega_1 \triangleq \{A \cap \Omega_1 : A \in \mathcal{F}\}.$$

$\mathcal{F}_2$  is called a *trace* of  $\mathcal{F}$  on  $\Omega_1$ . Show  $\mathcal{F}_1 = \mathcal{F}_2$ . (Hint: show that collection  $\mathcal{G} = \{E \in \mathcal{F} : E \cap \Omega_1 \in \mathcal{F}_1\}$  is a monotone class.)

**Solution:** For a collection  $\mathcal{D}$  and a space  $\Omega$  let  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{D})$  denote the smallest algebra of sets in  $\Omega$  containing  $\mathcal{D}$ .

Claim:  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1) = \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ .

By definition  $\mathcal{C} \subset \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  and therefore,  $\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1 \subset \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ . The empty set  $\phi = \phi \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ , as  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  is an algebra. Let  $E \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ , then  $(E \cap \Omega_1)^c = \Omega_1 \setminus (E \cap \Omega_1) = E^c \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ , as  $E \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  and  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  is an algebra. Let  $E_1 \cap \Omega_1, E_2 \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ , then  $(E_1 \cap \Omega_1) \cap (E_2 \cap \Omega_1) = (E_1 \cap E_2) \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ , as  $E_1, E_2 \in \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  and  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  is an algebra. Hence  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  is an algebra of sets in  $\Omega_1$  containing  $\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1$ , and by minimality of  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$ ,  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1) \subset \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1$ .

Consider the set

$$\mathcal{D}_1 = \{E \in 2^\Omega \mid E \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)\}.$$

The collection  $\mathcal{C} \subset \mathcal{D}_1$ , as  $\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1 \subset \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  by definition. The empty set  $\phi \cap \Omega_1 = \phi \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$ , as  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}$  is an algebra. Thus  $\phi \in \mathcal{D}_1$ . Let  $E \in \mathcal{D}_1$ , then  $E^c \cap \Omega_1 = \Omega_1 \setminus (E \cap \Omega_1) = (E \cap \Omega_1)^c \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$ , as  $E \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  and  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  is an algebra. Thus  $\mathcal{D}_1$  is closed under complements. Let  $E_1, E_2 \in \mathcal{D}_1$ , then  $(E_1 \cap E_2) \cap \Omega_1 = (E_1 \cap \Omega_1) \cap (E_2 \cap \Omega_1) \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$ , as  $E_1 \cap \Omega_1, E_2 \cap \Omega_1 \in \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  and  $\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  is an algebra. Thus  $\mathcal{D}_1$  is closed under intersections and  $\mathcal{D}_1$  is an algebra of sets in  $\Omega$  containing  $\mathcal{C}$ . Therefore, by minimality  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \subset \mathcal{D}_1$ . By definition of  $\mathcal{D}_1$ ,  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1 \subset \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$ , which proves the claim.

Claim: For a collection of sets  $\mathcal{D}$  and a space  $\Omega$ ,  $\sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D}) = \sigma_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{D}))$ .

By definition  $\mathcal{D} \subset \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{D}) \subset \sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D})$ , and by monotonicity of the  $\sigma_\Omega(\cdot)$  operator, see recitation 2,  $\sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D}) \subset \sigma_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{D})) \subset \sigma_\Omega(\sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D})) = \sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D})$ . Thus  $\sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{D}) = \sigma_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{D}))$ .

Combining the results of the two claims  $\sigma_{\Omega_1}(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1) = \sigma_{\Omega_1}(\alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)) = \sigma_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  and  $\sigma_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})) = \sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$ . Therefore, it suffices to show that  $\sigma_{\Omega_1}(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1) = \sigma_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})) \cap \Omega_1$ . By the monotone class theorem, as  $\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$  is an algebra, this holds if and only if  $\mu_{\Omega_1}(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1) = \mu_\Omega(\alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})) \cap \Omega_1$ . Let  $\mathcal{A} := \alpha_\Omega(\mathcal{C})$ .

By definition  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A})$  and therefore,  $\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1 \subset \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ . Let  $\{E_n \cap \Omega_1\} \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ , with  $(E_n \cap \Omega_1) \subset (E_{n+1} \cap \Omega_1)$ . The sequence  $\{E_n\}$  may not be monotone however,  $E'_n = \cup_{k=1}^n E_k$  is monotonic and by the monotonicity of  $\{E_n \cap \Omega_1\}$ ,  $(\cup_{k=1}^n E_k) \cap \Omega_1 = E_n \cap \Omega_1$ , i.e.  $E_n \cap \Omega_1 = E'_n \cap \Omega_1$ . Since  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A})$  is a monotone class  $E'_n \nearrow E \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A})$ . Therefore,  $E_n \cap \Omega_1 \nearrow E \cap \Omega_1 \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ , this follows since  $\bigcup_{n=1}^\infty (E_n \cap \Omega_1) = (\bigcup_{n=1}^\infty E_n) \cap \Omega_1 = E \cap \Omega_1$ . Similarly, let  $\{E_n \cap \Omega_1\} \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ , with  $(E_n \cap \Omega_1) \supset (E_{n+1} \cap \Omega_1)$ , and, by the construction given for increasing sets, WLOG  $E_n \supset E_{n+1}$ . Since  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A})$  is a monotone class  $E_n \searrow E \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A})$ . Therefore,  $E_n \cap \Omega_1 \searrow E \cap \Omega_1 \in \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ , this follows since  $\bigcap_{n=1}^\infty (E_n \cap \Omega_1) = (\bigcap_{n=1}^\infty E_n) \cap \Omega_1 = E \cap \Omega_1$ . Hence  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$  is a monotone class of sets in  $\Omega_1$  containing  $\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1$  and by minimality  $\mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1) \subset \mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1$ .

Consider the set

$$\mathcal{D}_2 = \{E \in 2^\Omega \mid E \cap \Omega_1 \in \mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)\}.$$

The algebra  $\mathcal{A} \subset \mathcal{D}_2$ , as  $\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1 \subset \alpha_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$  by definition. Let  $\{E_n\}$  be an increasing sequence of sets in  $\mathcal{D}_2$ , then  $\{E_n \cap \Omega_1\}$  is an increasing sequence of sets in  $\mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$ , and as  $\mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$  is a monotone class,  $(E_n \cap \Omega_1) \nearrow (E \cap \Omega_1) \in \mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$ . Therefore,  $E_n \nearrow E \in \mathcal{D}_1$ . A similar argument holds for a decreasing sequence of sets. Hence  $\mathcal{D}_2$  is a monotone class of sets in  $\Omega$  containing  $\mathcal{A}$ . Therefore, by minimality  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \subset \mathcal{D}_2$ . By definition of  $\mathcal{D}_2$ ,  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1 \subset \mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$ .

Hence  $\mu_\Omega(\mathcal{A}) \cap \Omega_1 = \mu_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{A} \cap \Omega_1)$ , and thusly,  $\sigma_\Omega(\mathcal{C}) \cap \Omega_1 = \sigma_{\Omega_1}(\mathcal{C} \cap \Omega_1)$  as desired.

**Exercise 8. [Optional, not to be graded]** Let  $\Omega = [0, 1)$  and let  $\mathcal{F}_0$  be the collection of finite unions  $\cup_{i=1}^N [a_i, b_i)$  for  $a_i, b_i \in [0, 1]$ . For any  $A \in \mathcal{F}_0$ , let  $\mathbb{P}[A] = 1$  if one of the  $b_i = 1$ , and  $\mathbb{P}[A] = 0$  otherwise. In Lectures we showed that  $\mathcal{F}_0$  is an algebra but not a  $\sigma$ -algebra.

(a) Show that  $\mathbb{P}$  is a non-negative (finitely) additive set-function on  $\mathcal{F}_0$ .

(b) Show that  $\mathbb{P}$  is not countably additive on  $\mathcal{F}_0$ .

**Solution:**

(a) For all  $A \in \mathcal{F}_0$ ,  $\mathbb{P}[A] \in \{0, 1\}$ . Thus  $\mathbb{P}$  is non-negative.

Let  $A_1, A_2 \in \mathcal{F}_0$  be disjoint. Then  $A_1 = \bigcup_{i=1}^{N_1} [a_i^{(1)}, b_i^{(1)})$  and  $A_2 = \bigcup_{j=1}^{N_2} [a_j^{(2)}, b_j^{(2)})$ , where WLOG the intervals are ordered and non are empty  $a_1^{(m)} < b_1^{(m)} < \dots < a_{N_m}^{(m)} < b_{N_m}^{(m)}$ . As  $A_1 \cap A_2 = \emptyset$ ,  $A_1 \cup A_2 = \bigcup_{k=1}^{N_1+N_2} [a_k^{(3)}, b_k^{(3)})$ , where  $a_k^{(3)} \in \{a_i^{(1)}, a_j^{(2)}\}$  and  $b_k^{(3)} \in \{b_i^{(1)}, b_j^{(2)}\}$  are the results of interleaving the two collections of intervals and are again WLOG ordered. By construction  $\mathbb{P}[A_1] = 1$  if and only if  $b_{N_1}^{(1)} = 1$ ,  $\mathbb{P}[A_2] = 1$  if and only if  $b_{N_2}^{(2)} = 1$  and  $\mathbb{P}[A_1 \cup A_2] = 1$  if and only if  $b_{N_1+N_2}^{(3)} = 1$ . Moreover,  $b_{N_1+N_2}^{(3)} = 1$  if and only if either  $b_{N_1}^{(1)} = 1$  or  $b_{N_2}^{(2)} = 1$ . Suppose  $b_{N_1+N_2}^{(3)} = 1$  and WLOG assume  $b_{N_1}^{(1)} = 1$ , then, as  $A_1$  and  $A_2$  are disjoint,  $b_{N_2}^{(2)} \neq 1$

$$\mathbb{P}(A_1 \cup A_2) = 1 = 1 + 0 = \mathbb{P}(A_1) + \mathbb{P}(A_2).$$

Suppose  $b_{N_1+N_2}^{(3)} \neq 1$  then neither  $b_{N_1}^{(1)} = 1$  nor  $b_{N_2}^{(2)} = 1$

$$\mathbb{P}(A_1 \cup A_2) = 0 = 0 + 0 = \mathbb{P}(A_1) + \mathbb{P}(A_2).$$

(b) Let  $A_n = [0, 1 - \frac{1}{n})$ . Then, for all  $n$ ,  $\mathbb{P}(A_n) = 0$ . Moreover,  $A_n \subset A_{n+1}$  and  $\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n = \bigcup_{n=1}^{\infty} A_n = [0, 1) \in \mathcal{F}_0$ . Hence, by continuity of probability,

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \mathbb{P}(A_n) = \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} 0 = 0 \neq 1 = \mathbb{P}([0, 1)) = \mathbb{P} \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} A_n,$$

and  $\mathbb{P}$  is not countably additive.



MIT OpenCourseWare  
<https://ocw.mit.edu>

6.436J / 15.085J Fundamentals of Probability  
Fall 2018

For information about citing these materials or our Terms of Use, visit <https://ocw.mit.edu/terms>